Original Research Article

An integrated network analysis reveals that nitric oxide reductase prevents metabolic cycling of nitric oxide by *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*

Jonathan L. Robinson¹,¹, Jacob M. Jaslove⁠¹, Allison M. Murawski⁠²,³, Christopher H. Fazen⁠¹,², Mark P. Brynildsen⁠¹,⁴,⁎

¹ Department of Chemical and Biological Engineering, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ 08544, USA
² Department of Molecular Biology, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ 08544, USA
³ Rutgers Robert Wood Johnson Medical School, Piscataway, NJ 08854, USA

⁎ Correspondence to: School of Engineering and Applied Science, Department of Chemical and Biological Engineering, Princeton University, 205 Hoyt Laboratory, 25 William Street, Princeton, NJ 08544, USA.
E-mail address: mbrynild@princeton.edu (M.P. Brynildsen).

¹ Present address: Department of Biology and Biological Engineering, Chalmers University of Technology, SE412 96 Gothenburg, Sweden.
² Present address: Department of Chemistry, The College of New Jersey, Ewing, NJ 08628, USA.

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:
Metabolic cycle
Kinetic model
Oscillations
NO reductase
Flp
Denitrification

ABSTRACT

Nitric oxide (NO) is a chemical weapon within the arsenal of immune cells, but is also generated endogenously by different bacteria. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* are pathogens that contain an NO-generating nitrite (NO₂⁻) reductase (NirS), and NO has been shown to influence their virulence. Interestingly, *P. aeruginosa* also contain NO dioxygenase (Flp) and nitrate (NO₃⁻) reductases, which together with NirS provide the potential for NO to be metabolically cycled (NO→NO₃⁻→NO₂⁻→NO). Deeper understanding of NO metabolism in *P. aeruginosa* will increase knowledge of its pathogenesis, and computational models have proven to be useful tools for the quantitative dissection of NO biochemical networks. Here we developed such a model for *P. aeruginosa* and confirmed its predictive accuracy with measurements of NO, O₂, NO₂⁻, and NO₃⁻ in mutant cultures devoid of Flp or NorCB (NO reductase) activity. Using the model, we assessed whether NO was metabolically cycled in aerobic *P. aeruginosa* cultures. Calculated fluxes indicated a bottleneck at NO₃⁻, which was relieved upon O₂ depletion. As cell growth depleted dissolved O₂ levels, NO₃⁻ was converted to NO₂⁻ at near-stoichiometric levels, whereas NO₂⁻ consumption did not coincide with NO or NO₃⁻ accumulation. Assimilatory NO₂⁻ reductase (NirBD) or NorCB activity could have prevented NO cycling, and experiments with ΔnirB, ΔnirS, and ΔnorC showed that NorCB was responsible for loss of flux from the cycle. Collectively, this work provides a computational tool to analyze NO metabolism in *P. aeruginosa*, and establishes that *P. aeruginosa* use NorCB to prevent metabolic cycling of NO.

1. Introduction

*Pseudomonas aeruginosa* are a common cause of infections on biomedical devices, at surgical sites, and within the airways of cystic fibrosis patients (Driscoll et al., 2007; Winstanley et al., 2016). Treatment of *P. aeruginosa* infections is di fficult because they are Gram-negative bacteria that are avid biofilm formers (O’Toole and Kolter, 1998; Drenkard and Ausubel, 2002) and they possess both broad-spectrum β-lactamases and numerous multidrug efflux pumps, which make them naturally resistant to many antibiotics (Breidenstein et al., 2011; Gellatly and Hancock, 2013). Further, antibiotics that were once effective against *P. aeruginosa*, such as fluoroquinolones and aminoglycosides, are now innocuous to many clinical isolates due to the rise and spread of multidrug resistant (MDR) strains (Poole, 2011).

This confluence of challenges has motivated many searches for new agents or methodologies to treat *P. aeruginosa* infections (Siryporn et al., 2014; Ketelboeter et al., 2014; Miller et al., 2015; Hentzer et al., 2003). One particularly promising avenue involves targeting the processes that pathogens use to cause illness rather than those that are essential to its propagation under any circumstance (Hentzer et al., 2003). Conventional antibiotics fall into the latter category, applying selective pressure both inside and outside the human body (e.g., sewage, soil, water), whereas antivirulence therapies comprise the former category, confining selective pressure to within the host (Allen et al., 2014; Cegelski et al., 2008; Escaich, 2008; Baquero et al., 2008). Such agents would be orthogonal to current treatments, and their focused nature is projected to produce resistance at far greater time scales than antibiotics (Allen et al., 2014).
To facilitate the development of antivirulence therapies, much work has been conducted to increase understanding of *P. aeruginosa* pathogenesis and its physiology within host environments (Gellatly and Hancock, 2013; Hauser, 2009; O’Loughlin et al., 2013; Yoon et al., 2002). During pathogenesis, *P. aeruginosa* are exposed to nitric oxide (NO) generated by immune cells, such as macrophages (Darling and Evans, 2003; Kakishima et al., 2007). NO is a toxic metabolite that readily reacts with iron-sulfur clusters ([Fe-S]), heme cofactors, and other transition metal centers, and several of its autoxidation products can damage free or protein-bound thiols, tyrosine residues, and DNA bases (Bowman et al., 2011; Hyduke et al., 2007; Poole and Hughes, 2000; Robinson et al., 2014a). To counteract the nitrosative assault of immune cells, *P. aeruginosa* employ detoxification systems, such NO reductase and NO dioxygenase, which are encoded by *norCB* and *fhp*, respectively (Arai et al., 2005, 1995). In essence, *P. aeruginosa* employs these enzymes to divert flux of NO away from reactions that damage the pathogen (e.g., nitrosylation of Fe-S clusters) toward reactions that neutralize this toxic metabolite (e.g., reduction to N₂O). From a metabolic engineering perspective, this is analogous to that of *E. coli* (N₂O). From a metabolic engineering perspective, this is analogous to that of *E. coli* (N₂O). From a metabolic engineering perspective, this is analogous to that of *E. coli* (N₂O).

In a later study, the same mutants were shown to be more sensitive to NO₂ at infection sites (Hassett et al., 2002). Importantly, NO₂ is the end product of the reaction of NO with O₂, and can therefore be present in a subsequent enzymatic step. Interestingly, elevated levels of NO₂ were measured more quickly than wild-type (WT) by LPS-activated macrophages, and that the survival difference was eliminated with use of an inducible nitric oxide synthase (iNOS) inhibitor (Kakishima et al., 2007).

Beyond improving survival in macrophages, *P. aeruginosa* NO metabolism has been associated with numerous pathogenic processes (Barraud et al., 2006, 2009; Van Alst et al., 2009a, 2007). For example, NO was found to stimulate dispersal of *P. aeruginosa* biofilms by increasing phosphodiesterase activity, which reduced the level of cyclic-di-GMP (Barraud et al., 2009). Endogenous NO production by *P. aeruginosa* from one of its NO₂ reductases (NirS) has been identified as a mediator of both virulence factor expression and biofilm dispersal (Barraud et al., 2006; Van Alst et al., 2007). Van Alst and colleagues observed that both Δ*nirG* and Δ*nirS* *P. aeruginosa* were far less virulent to *Caenorhabditis elegans* than the WT (Van Alst et al., 2007). In a later study, the same mutants were shown to be more sensitive to killing by human monocytes, and found to be defective in expression of a type III secretion system (Van Alst et al., 2009a). Barraud and colleagues observed that biofilms of Δ*nirS* dispersed far less than those of WT, and provided evidence that low concentrations of NO were the cause (Barraud et al., 2006). Importantly, NO₂ is a relatively stable end product of the reaction of NO with O₂, and can therefore be present at infection sites (Hassett et al., 2002).

The influence of the *P. aeruginosa* NO network on pathogenic processes suggests that deeper quantitative understanding of how it functions as a system could reveal strategies to sabotage *P. aeruginosa* pathogenesis. In this regard, a parallel can be drawn to metabolic engineering, where deeper knowledge of how metabolism functions as an interconnected system will reveal ways to improve chemical production. Such knowledge is provided with the use of computational models (Chowdhury et al., 2014; Karr et al., 2012; Khodayari et al., 2014), and the same applies to NO, which is a highly reactive molecule with an expansive biochemical reaction network (Robinson et al., 2014a; Robinson and Brynlidsen, 2013; Lancaster, 2006; Lim et al., 2008). Computational models of NO biochemistry and regulation have increased understanding of NO biology from mammalian to bacterial systems (Robinson and Brynlidsen, 2013; Lancaster, 2006; Lim et al., 2008; Bagci et al., 2008; Hu et al., 2006; Lewis et al., 1995; Robinson et al., 2014b), and in one recent example, we used a model of *E. coli* NO stress to unravel the mechanism behind NO oscillations in low O₂ environments (Robinson and Brynlidsen, 2016a). With respect to *P. aeruginosa* and NO, a previous mathematical model of the regulatory network associated with denitrification was developed by Arat et al. (2015). In that study, a qualitative, discrete-variable model of the *P. aeruginosa* denitrification regulatory network was constructed to understand the impact of environmental variables, such as phosphate and O₂, on the system (Arat et al., 2015). Notably, that model was time-independent, encompassed only the denitrification pathway (NO₃⁻ to N₂), and was qualitative in the sense that all variables were either Boolean or ternary ("low," "medium," "high"). In addition, a genome-scale metabolic model of *P. aeruginosa* has been constructed (Oberhardt et al., 2008, 2011), which provides a valuable resource and framework for studies of the *P. aeruginosa* metabolic network (Oberhardt et al., 2010; Varga et al., 2015); however, the absence of kinetics and many NO-specific reactions precludes its use for dynamic analyses of NO stress in *P. aeruginosa*.

In this work, we had two goals: (1) develop a quantitative model of the *P. aeruginosa* NO network that would provide a computational tool for examination of the dynamics of this metabolic system, and (2) assess whether an NO cycle present in the metabolic network was functional (Fig. 1). Specifically, *P. aeruginosa* contains enzymes that can perform the conversion of NO→NO₃⁻→NO₂→NO. This cycle is composed of NO dioxygenase, NO₂ reductase, and NO₃⁻ reductase activities, which would collectively deplete NO only to regenerate it in a subsequent enzymatic step. Interestingly, elevated levels of NO₂ and NO₃⁻ have been found in the lungs of cystic fibrosis patients, who often suffer from *P. aeruginosa* infections, and this has been interpreted as an indication of increased NO production by host immune cells, which suggests that *P. aeruginosa* infection environments contain all three metabolites of the NO cycle (Hassett et al., 2002; Kolen et al., 2014). In addition, the *P. aeruginosa* NO cycle network architecture is distinct from that of *Escherichia coli*, which has served as a model Gram-negative bacterium for the study of NO metabolism (Bowman et al., 2011; Robinson and Brynlidsen, 2013; Mason et al., 2013).
2009; Gardner et al., 1998), because the NO$_3^-$ reductases of E. coli generate ammonia (NH$_3$) rather than NO (Keseler et al., 2013; Cole, 1996), and thus E. coli does not have the capacity to cycle NO. In fact, P. aeruginosa has a similar, additional NO$_2^-$ reductase (NirBD) that produces NH$_3$, which would prevent an NO cycle, as well as an NO reductase (NorCB) that would convert NO to N$_2$O (Arai, 1995; Romeo et al., 2012; Winsor et al., 2016). Due to these potential exit strategies and differences that exist in the regulation of these enzymes (Romeo et al., 2012; Kuroki et al., 2014), it was uncertain whether an NO cycle would occur.

To accomplish the first of our goals, we constructed a quantitative, kinetic model of NO stress in P. aeruginosa, and experimentally validated its predictions of NO metabolism in mutants devoid of NO dioxygenase and NO reductase, ∆fhp and ∆norC, respectively. This model can serve as a valuable tool to calculate validated its predictions of NO metabolism in mutants devoid of NO reductase and immediately following NO stress, which suggested that NO$_3^-$ reductase was not functioning appreciably. Given the role of O$_2$ in regulation of NO$_3^-$ reductase activity (Hernandez and Rowe, 1987; Schreiber et al., 2007), we allowed cultures to grow and deplete O$_2$ from the media. When dissolved O$_2$ concentrations dropped to ~3 μM, NO$_3^-$ consumption and NO$_2^-$ accumulation were observed. Interestingly, NO became briefly detectable upon NO$_2^-$ accumulation, but the quantitative amounts were small and NO$_3^-$ failed to accumulate again, which pointed to a mechanism by which P. aeruginosa prevented the NO cycle. Subsequent analyses with genetic mutants identified NO reductase (NorCB) as the major enzyme removing flux from the NO cycle, and in its absence, NO concentrations oscillated with an amplitude (defined here as the peak NO concentration) of ~3 μM and period of ~5 min. These oscillations were consistent with a recently identified stress-metabolic oscillator that originates from a network. The NO, NO$_2^-$, and NO$_3^-$ processing pathways share some similarities between E. coli and P. aeruginosa; specifically, NO dioxygenase (Hmp in E. coli, Fhp in P. aeruginosa), and NO, NO$_2^-$, and NO$_3^-$ reductases (NOR, NIR, and NAR, respectively) are present in both species. However, P. aeruginosa possesses an additional type of NIR that reduces NO$_2^-$ to generate NO (dissimilatory NIR, NirS) in addition to a NIR that generates NH$_3$ (assimilatory NIR, NirBD). This is of particular interest because NirS would enable NO to be generated endogenously from NO$_2^-$ (Fig. 1), which is a function that has been shown previously to modulate biofilm dispersal and expression of virulence factors in P. aeruginosa (Barraud et al., 2006, 2009). Therefore, the NIR and NAR enzymes of P. aeruginosa were added to the model. Furthermore, the transcriptional regulatory network governing expression of these and the NO detoxification enzymes was reconstructed in the PAO1 model to account for differences in regulatory structure from that of E. coli. This involved the addition of three transcription factors to the PAO1 model: the anaerobic response regulator (ANR), denitrification response regulator (DNR), and a two-component NO$_3^-$ sensing regulator (NarX) (Keseler et al., 2013; Cole, 2011). These three transcription factors and their regulatory interactions were also included in the P. aeruginosa regulatory network constructed by Arat et al. (2015); however, the present implementation enables quantitative analysis of time-dependent changes in this pathway, and does so in the context of a larger, more expansive network.

2.1.1. Model construction

A quantitative kinetic model of the NO stress network in P. aeruginosa PAO1 was constructed using an existing E. coli K-12 MG1655 model (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a) as a template, and following a procedure that was recently implemented to develop a model for enterohemorrhagic E. coli O157:H7 (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016b) (see Section 4.7 for additional construction details, Table S1 for model species, Tables S2 and S3 for model reactions, and Model S1 for the complete model file). A large amount of the E. coli model structure was retained, including 113 biochemical species (77% of the E. coli model), 119 reaction rate expressions (69%), and 131 kinetic parameters (69%), but there were also a number of substantial changes needed to adapt the model to P. aeruginosa. The most notable differences between the E. coli and P. aeruginosa networks involved the aerobic respiratory quinol oxidases and the denitrification enzymes. E. coli possesses three aerobic (O$_2$-consuming) cytochrome quinol oxidases: cytochromes bo, bd-I, and bd-II (Cyo, Cyl, and AppCB, respectively) (Keseler et al., 2013). P. aeruginosa, however, harbors five different cytochrome terminal oxidases, two of which are ubiquinol oxidases (Cyo and cyanide insensitive oxidase (CIO)), whereas the other three are cytochrome c oxidases (Cbb3-1, Cbb3-2, and Aa3) (Arai, 2011; Karcheski et al., 2016). The three E. coli quinol oxidases in the model were therefore replaced with the five P. aeruginosa systems.

The NO, NO$_2^-$, and NO$_3^-$ processing pathways share some similarities between E. coli and P. aeruginosa; specifically, NO dioxygenase (Hmp in E. coli, Fhp in P. aeruginosa), and NO, NO$_2^-$, and NO$_3^-$ reductases (NOR, NIR, and NAR, respectively) are present in both species. However, P. aeruginosa possesses an additional type of NIR that reduces NO$_2^-$ to generate NO (dissimilatory NIR, NirS) in addition to a NIR that generates NH$_3$ (assimilatory NIR, NirBD). This is of particular interest because NirS would enable NO to be generated endogenously from NO$_2^-$ (Fig. 1), which is a function that has been shown previously to modulate biofilm dispersal and expression of virulence factors in P. aeruginosa (Barraud et al., 2006, 2009). Therefore, the NIR and NAR enzymes of P. aeruginosa were added to the model. Furthermore, the transcriptional regulatory network governing expression of these and the NO detoxification enzymes was reconstructed in the PAO1 model to account for differences in regulatory structure from that of E. coli. This involved the addition of three transcription factors to the PAO1 model: the anaerobic response regulator (ANR), denitrification response regulator (DNR), and a two-component NO$_3^-$ sensing regulator (NarX) (Keseler et al., 2013; Cole, 2011). These three transcription factors and their regulatory interactions were also included in the P. aeruginosa regulatory network constructed by Arat et al. (2015); however, the present implementation enables quantitative analysis of time-dependent changes in this pathway, and does so in the context of a larger, more expansive network.
to fit $[O_2]$ data measured in untreated PAO1 cultures (Table S5). The optimization process mirrored that described for the extracellular parameters, where a subsequent MCMC procedure was performed to allow estimation of parameter and prediction uncertainty. The simulated $[O_2]$ curve generated using the ensemble of models exhibited excellent agreement with experimental measurements (Fig. S3).

The final model training process involved all the remaining cellular parameters governing NO-stress related damage, inhibition, detoxification, and repair. A total of 137 parameters were optimized to simultaneously fit $[NO]$ and $[O_2]$ curves, as well as $[NO_2^-]$ and $[NO_3^-]$ at 0.5 h post-DPTA treatment, measured in a WT culture of $P. aeruginosa$ treated with 50 μM DPTA (Table S6). To incorporate uncertainty of cell-free and respiratory parameter values into the final ensemble of models, those parameters were included with the other 137 cellular parameters in the subsequent MCMC analysis and permitted to vary within their confidence intervals (CIs), which were determined in the above-mentioned steps (Section 4.8.3). Simulations run using the resulting ensemble were in good agreement with measured $[NO]$, $[O_2]$, $[NO_2^-]$, and $[NO_3^-]$ data (Fig. 2A).

2.1.3. Experimental validation of model predictions

The predictive accuracy of the model was assessed by comparing simulated and measured $[NO]$, $[O_2]$, $[NO_2^-]$, and $[NO_3^-]$ data for cultures of $P. aeruginosa$ mutants lacking either of the two major NO detoxification systems: NO dioxygenase ($\Delta fhp$) and NO reductase ($\Delta norC$). Simulations predicted negligible differences in NO, $O_2$, $NO_2^-$, and $NO_3^-$ concentrations between WT and $\Delta norC$ cultures, whereas the $\Delta fhp$ mutant was predicted to exhibit severe inhibition of NO detoxification and, as a result, respiration. The greater importance of Fhp compared to NorCB under these conditions was expected, given that NO dioxygenases have been shown to dominate NO detoxification under aerobic conditions, whereas anaerobic conditions are favorable for NO reductase activity (Arai et al., 2005, 1995; Robinson and Brynildsen, 2013, 2016a; Zumft, 1997; Gardner, 2005). The corresponding experiments were performed, for which cultures of $\Delta fhp$ and $\Delta norC$ were treated with 50 μM DPTA NONOate under aerobic conditions. The predicted and measured $[NO]$ and $[O_2]$ curves, as well as $[NO_2^-]$ and $[NO_3^-]$ at 0.5 h post-dose were in excellent agreement for both mutants, demonstrating that the model had correctly predicted the contributions of Fhp and NorCB to aerobic NO detoxification (Fig. 2B and C, respectively).

2.2. Computational analysis of NO cycle activity

An interesting difference between the NO biochemical reaction networks of $E. coli$ and $P. aeruginosa$ is the presence of a NO-generating $NO_2^-$ reductase in $P. aeruginosa$ (NirS). With NirS, $P. aeruginosa$ could conceivably detoxify NO with Fhp to form $NO_3^-$, the $NO_3^-$ could be processed by NAR to generate $NO_2^-$, and NirS could generate NO from the resulting $NO_2^-$ (Fig. 1). This three-enzyme
system forms a biochemical equivalent to “kicking the can down the road”, where NO would be chemically pacified only to arise again at a future time. Such a scenario could be prevented if NO\textsubscript{2} were processed by the assimilatory reductase, NirBD, which yields NH\textsubscript{3} rather than NO, or if NO were detoxified by NO reductase, NorCB, which yields N\textsubscript{2}O rather than NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{−} (Fig. 1). Given the data presented in Fig. 2, which demonstrated that Fhp was a major cellular consumption pathway under the conditions investigated here, we sought to assess whether aerobic \textit{P. aeruginosa} cultures execute this NO cycle. To do this, we calculated the flux through each of the enzymes comprising the NO metabolic cycle, as well as the distribution of NO flux through all other available pathways, using the ensemble of viable models that we had constructed.

Treatment of WT PAO1 with 50 \(\mu\text{M}\) DPTA NONOate was simulated by the ensemble and the results were consistent with the large impact of \(\Delta fhp\) on NO detoxification dynamics (Fig. 3A); Fhp was predicted to account for the majority of NO consumption, reaching \(\sim 24 \mu\text{M}\) NO by 0.5 h, compared to the \(\sim 5 \mu\text{M}\) NO consumed by autoxidation in the media and loss to the gas phase. Flux of NO through other pathways, such as [Fe-S] nitrosylation, was negligible, cumulatively accounting for less than 0.03 \(\mu\text{M}\) of NO consumed. Deletion of \textit{fhp} from the ensemble eliminated the majority of cellular-related NO consumption, leaving autoxidation and escape to the gas phase as the two major pathways (Fig. 3B), though we note that flux through reactions that damage biomolecules were generally increased (\textit{e.g.}, [Fe-S] nitrosylation increased to a maximum of 0.09 \(\mu\text{M}\) cumulative NO consumed). Removal of \textit{norC} exhibited nearly the same metabolic flux distribution as WT (Fig. 3C).

In terms of the NO cycle, the calculated NO\textsubscript{X} consumption by NAR and NirS in WT were orders of magnitude lower than that of Fhp, reaching a cumulative consumption (by 0.5 h post-dose) of only 0.001–0.005 \(\mu\text{M}\) NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{−} and 0.0002–0.004 \(\mu\text{M}\) NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{−}, respectively. Similar results were observed when simulating \(\Delta fhp\) and \(\Delta norC\) mutants, except for the complete elimination of NAR activity in \(\Delta fhp\) due to the absence of NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{−} supply by Fhp. These predictions suggested that the full cycle (NO→NO\textsubscript{3}→NO\textsubscript{2}→NO) was not active under the conditions used here, and that it primarily stalled at NO\textsubscript{3}−. The low activities of the NO\textsubscript{3}− and NO\textsubscript{2}− reductases were likely a result of the aerobic environment, as these enzymes function optimally under anaerobic to microaerobic conditions (Schreiber et al., 2007; Arai, 2011). We therefore reasoned that progression through the NO cycle might occur as O\textsubscript{2} depleted as a result of respiration and cell growth.

2.3. Quantification of NO, NO\textsubscript{1−}, and NO\textsubscript{2−} dynamics in WT \textit{P. aeruginosa} cultures

With the hypothesis that cell-mediated depletion of O\textsubscript{2} from the culture could activate the other branches of the NO cycle, we extended
the duration of experiments. Following relief of NO-induced respiratory inhibition, which occurred at ~0.25 h post DPTA treatment, O$_2$ was consumed rapidly and periodic quantification of [NO$_2^-$] and [NO$_3^-$] revealed that virtually all NO$_2^-$ and NO$_3^-$ generated from DPTA was consumed by 3.5 h post-treatment (Fig. 4A).

We note that the computational model constructed in the previous sections was not designed to account for the complexities associated with transitioning from an antimicrobial-induced bacteriostasis to an unstressed growing state. Therefore, computational analyses were not used to examine experimental data beyond 0.5 h, which was the final measured time point at which the cell density of the culture was not statistically higher than that of the initial time point (Fig. S4). We note that this functional constraint was also present in the predecessors of this model, which were constructed to examine NO stress networks in E. coli (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2013, 2016a, 2015). Furthermore, the P. aeruginosa model was not trained on experimental measurements from low-[O$_2$] conditions, which manifest as culture densities that this functional constraint was also present in the predecessors of this model, which were constructed to examine NO stress networks in E. coli (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2013, 2016a, 2015). Furthermore, the P. aeruginosa model was not trained on experimental measurements from low-[O$_2$] conditions, which manifest as culture densities increase. Such O$_2$-limited conditions are of interest due to the diversity of O$_2$ levels encountered by P. aeruginosa during infections, and augmenting the model to account for those environmental conditions represents an area of future growth for this research.

For ~1 h after DPTA treatment, [NO$_2^-$] remained negligible, whereas [NO$_3^-$] increased rapidly to 43.5 ± 0.6 μM (Fig. 4A). This behavior was consistent with NO consumption being dominated by NO dioxygenase (Fhp), the main product of which is NO$_3^-$. The negligible production of NO$_2^-$ during this period was attributed to the rapid consumption of NO by Fhp, which prevents appreciable NO$_2^-$ generation from autoxidation, and the absence of NAR activity, which reduces NO$_3^-$ to NO$_2^-$. Inspection of the corresponding WT [O$_2$] dynamics revealed a brief ~0.25 h period of NO-induced respiratory arrest, followed by resumption of O$_2$ consumption upon clearance of NO from the culture media. Despite having the culture open to the ambient air, the respiratory activity was sufficient to deplete O$_2$ by 1 h post-DPTA treatment, stabilizing at ~3 μM O$_2$. The depletion of O$_2$ from the culture coincided with a decrease in [NO$_3^-$], and an increase in [NO$_2^-$], indicating the initiation of NAR activity. Within an hour after NAR activity was observable, the concentration of NO$_2^-$ rapidly decreased, which suggested that NirBD and/or NirS was active. However, this rapid consumption of NO$_2^-$ was not matched by concurrent increases in NO or NO$_3^-$, which suggested that either NO$_3^-$ was being converted by NirBD to NH$_3$ and/or the NO generated by NirS was being detoxified by NorCB, which generates N$_2$O.

2.4. Genetic investigation of NO, NO$_3^-$, and NO$_2^-$ dynamics

We sought to determine the enzymes responsible for NO, NO$_3^-$, and NO$_2^-$ reduction in NO-stressed P. aeruginosa cultures, which concomitantly would identify whether NirBD or NorCB were preventing the NO cycle. Given that the only appreciable source of NO$_3^-$ could be Fhp, we hypothesized that negligible NO$_3^-$ production would be observed in a Δfhp culture treated with DPTA. As expected, when Δfhp cultures were treated with DPTA, only trace levels of NO$_3^-$ were observed, which confirmed that Fhp was the primary source of NO$_3^-$ under these conditions (Fig. 4B). Notably, NO$_2^-$ was generated at a rate similar to that observed in the absence of cells (Fig. S5), which suggested an active autoxidation pathway. Unlike WT, Δfhp did not exhibit rapid NO$_2^-$ reductase activity, where only a modest decrease in [NO$_2^-$] relative to the cell-free control was observed at later times (final [NO$_2^-$]=51.7 ± 0.6 μM for Δfhp compared to the 58.9 ± 1.3 μM measured in the absence of cells). This could have resulted from NO-
mediated inhibition of NIR (Silvestrini et al., 1994), given that NO was cleared much slower from the Δfhp culture than WT (> 2 h vs. ~0.25 h, respectively), or the higher [O₂] in the Δfhp culture, which could inhibit NIR expression and/or activity (Arai, 2011). Further, since NIR expression is partially activated by NO₃⁻ (Schreiber et al., 2007; Arai, 2011), the lack of NO₃⁻ may have contributed to decreased NIR activity. Collectively, the results from NO-stressed Δfhp demonstrated that Fhp was the source of NO₃⁻.

In WT cultures, consumption of NO₃⁻ coincided with depletion of O₂ (Fig. 4A). Given that NIR activity in P. aeruginosa is known to function primarily under low-O₂ conditions (Hernandez and Rowe, 1987; Schreiber et al., 2007; Arai, 2011), we reasoned that one or more of the P. aeruginosa NARs were responsible for the observed NO₃⁻ consumption. To determine the enzyme(s) contributing to the measured NO₃⁻ consumption, DPTA treatment assays were conducted with ΔnarG, which inactivates a membrane-bound cytoplasmic NO₃⁻ reductase, and ΔnapA, which inactivates a periplasmic NO₃⁻ reductase (Schreiber et al., 2007; Arai, 2011; Zumft, 1997; Palmer et al., 2007; Van Alst et al., 2009b). Deletion of napA had a negligible effect on all measured metabolites (Fig. S6), whereas loss of NarG eliminated virtually all NO₃⁻ consumption (Fig. 4C). Consistent with the loss of NO₃⁻ consumption in ΔnarG cultures, the corresponding production of NO₂⁻ was eliminated. This confirmed that the sharp increase in [NO₂⁻] observed in DPTA-treated WT cultures at ~1 h post dose was caused by NAR, and attributed the effect specifically to NarGHI ([NO₂⁻] dynamics of ΔnapA were indistinguishable from those of WT).

With Fhp and NarGHI confirmed to be the respective NO₃⁻ and NO₂⁻ sources in NO-stressed P. aeruginosa, we sought to identify whether NirBD or NirS was responsible for NO₂⁻ consumption. If NirS were found to contribute to NO₂⁻ consumption, it would mean that NO was only temporarily deactivated to arise again later, whereas if NirBD were the major consumption pathway, NO detoxification by Fhp would be the first step in a non-cyclic NO deactivation pathway. The rapid decrease in [NO₂⁻] during the WT DPTA treatment assay confirmed the presence of NIR activity, but held no information regarding the relative contributions of NirBD and NirS. To assess what portion of the observed NIR activity could be attributed to NirBD and NirS, DPTA treatment assays were conducted with ΔnirS and ΔnirBD mutants. Deletion of nirB had a negligible effect on the measured [NO], [O₂], [NO₂⁻], and [NO₃⁻] compared to WT (Fig. S6), suggesting that NirBD was either not expressed or was inactive under the conditions studied. Conversely, NO₂⁻ consumption in the ΔnirS culture was almost entirely eliminated, where [NO₂⁻] peaked similarly to WT at ~2 h post-DPTA dose, but remained steady at ~66 µM for the remainder of the assay (Fig. 4D). These data suggest that P. aeruginosa detoxifies NO with Fhp, only to have it appear again at a later time (when NirS reduces NO₂⁻ to NO). Further, the ΔnirS data in conjunction with that of WT, which showed that negligible amounts of NO, NO₂⁻, or NO₃⁻ were present after 2.5 h (Fig. 4A), suggested that NO was being siphoned from the cycle and prevented from entering a second round of deactivation by Fhp. Possible pathways that could remove NO from the cycle were exchange with the gas phase, which was not rapid enough to explain the quantitative losses of NO, NO₂⁻, and NO₃⁻ (given a kₜ,o₂ of 8.6 h⁻¹ and [NO] < 1 µM in the culture, the amount of NO₂⁻ that could be lost as NO to the gas phase over a span of 30 min would be under 1 µM x 8.6 h⁻¹ x 0.5 h = 4.3 µM NO, which is an order of magnitude less than the observed ~50 µM NO₂⁻ decrease), or NorCB, which reduces NO to N₂O.

In general, NORs require anaerobic or low-O₂ environments to function, as O₂ impairs their activity (Arai et al., 1995; Zumft, 1997; Gardner and Gardner, 2002). This is consistent with the initial DPTA-treatment assays conducted to validate the model predictions, where ΔnorC NO consumption was indistinguishable from that of WT during the first 0.5 h post-DPTA dose (Fig. 2). However, after 1 h the [O₂] was ~3 µM, which are conditions more conducive to NOR activity. To assess whether NorCB prevented NO cycling, DPTA treatment assays were performed with ΔnorC. During the first hour following DPTA treatment, ΔnorC behaved identically to WT (Fig. 4E), which was expected given that the dissolved [O₂] had just reached a low level and NO₂⁻ had yet to be appreciably consumed. However, approximately 15 min later, the [NO] dynamics of ΔnorC cultures began to deviate from that of WT, exhibiting sustained oscillations of increasing amplitude (Fig. 4E). The [NO] oscillations continued for the remaining duration of the assay (3.5 h post-DPTA treatment), at which point the amplitude had reached the initial peak height of ~3 µM NO. Similar oscillations were observed in [O₂], shifted slightly out of phase with those of [NO] (Fig. S7A), which was consistent with a previously-identified oscillatory mechanism driven by a competition between NO dioxygenase and respiratory cytochromes over the limited dissolved O₂ in the system (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a). Further, [NO₃⁻] in the ΔnorC culture did not drop as rapidly as WT, and the [NO₃⁻] began increasing in ΔnorC at the time when [NO₂⁻] declined, whereas [NO₃⁻] remained at undetectable levels in WT cultures after its initial clearance. These data confirmed that NorCB was the major pathway siphoning NO from the NO cycle prior to its second deactivation by Fhp.

2.5. Analysis of NO cycle initiated by NO₃⁻

Results presented in Fig. 4 suggest that P. aeruginosa initially detoxifies NO to NO₃⁻ only to have it arise again later from NO₂⁻. Within the assays presented thus far, NO is delivered to cultures by release from DPTA. In consideration of the kinetic release rate of DPTA, only ~30 µM of NO would have been left to be released from DPTA by 1.5 h post-dose, which corresponded to the time that NO briefly returned to WT cultures and ΔnorC began exhibiting NO oscillations. Given this calculation, data from ΔnirS, and the magnitude of NO oscillations in ΔnorC, it is reasonable to assume that NO₃⁻ consumption sustained the NO cycle and oscillations in ΔnorC. However, to provide further experimental evidence that the NO cycle is driven by endogenous NO production, cultures of WT and ΔnorC P. aeruginosa were treated with a single bolus of 100 µM NO₃⁻ (final concentration) at time zero (DPTA was not present), and the resulting [NO], [O₂], [NO₂⁻], and [NO₃⁻] were monitored for 3.5 h (Fig. 5).

For both strains, within the first 0.5 h of NO₃⁻ addition, there was no change in any of the measured metabolite concentrations except O₂, which was steadily depleted from the cultures. By 1 h post-dose, the [O₂] had stabilized at ~3 µM (~1.5% of the air-saturated O₂ concentration), and NAR activity began converting the NO₃⁻ to NO₂⁻. Flux through the NO₃⁻ to NO₂⁻ arm of the cycle increased considerably between 1 and 1.5 h, as illustrated by large drops in [NO₃⁻] and concurrent increases in [NO₂⁻] for both strains. The rate of NO₂⁻ consumption greatly increased over the next 0.5 h for WT, where [NO₃⁻] decreased to ~7 µM at 2 h post-NO₃⁻ treatment. Consistent with results from DPTA treatments, consumption of NO₂⁻ did not coincide with a comparable increase in NO for WT, and neither NO, NO₃⁻, nor NO₂⁻ were detected at later time points. However, unlike WT, with ΔnorC NO became detectable when NO₂⁻ began to accumulate, and its concentration oscillated (Fig. 5B). Oscillations in [O₂] that were slightly off-phase with [NO] were observed (Fig. S7B), NO₂⁻ consumption was slower than that of WT, and NO₃⁻ began to accumulate in ΔnorC cultures. These data provide additional evidence that NO cycles in P. aeruginosa cultures when NorCB activity is absent, and that it is endogenously generated NO that contributes to this process.

2.6. Analysis of the period and amplitude of NO oscillations

The metabolic oscillations reported here for ΔnorC cultures of P. aeruginosa resemble those of a previous study we performed on microaerobic NO detoxification (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a). However, there are notable differences in the oscillation dynamics,
and monitored for 3.5 h post-dose. Concentrations of NO and O\textsubscript{2} were measured continuously, whereas NO\textsubscript{2}

PAO1 cultures at an initial OD\textsubscript{600} of 0.05 were treated with 100 μM NaNO\textsubscript{3} at time zero, and monitored for 3.5 h post-dose. Concentrations of NO and O\textsubscript{2} were measured continuously, whereas NO\textsubscript{2} and NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{−} were quantified every 0.5 h. Solid black lines (or circles) are the mean of 3 independent experiments, with gray shading (or error bars) representing the SEM. The exception is [NO] and [O\textsubscript{2}] of ΔnorC, which are data from one representative experiment because averaging multiple experiments obscures the oscillatory dynamics (see Fig. S10 for remaining ΔnorC data).

especially with regard to amplitude and period. For example, from our previous study, the period and amplitude of the largest NO oscillation were approximately 10 min and 0.5 μM in E. coli populations cultured in environments where 10 μM [O\textsubscript{2}] was the concentration in equilibrium with the surrounding atmosphere, whereas the period and amplitude of the largest oscillation in ΔnorC P. aeruginosa populations cultured here (equilibrium [O\textsubscript{2}] of 210 μM) was approximately 3 min and 3.4 μM, respectively. Further, in our previous study, we observed NO oscillations in WT P. aeruginosa populations cultured in environments where 50 μM [O\textsubscript{2}] was the concentration in equilibrium with the surrounding atmosphere, and the period and amplitude of the largest oscillation was approximately 4 min and 0.35 μM. Since these differences in oscillation dynamics could be attributed to environmental or bacteria-associated factors, we sought to identify those variables with considerable influence on the oscillation properties. To do this, we turned to a minimal NO model that displays these metabolic oscillations from our previous study, and analyzed how varying the magnitudes of parameters associated with environmental and bacteria-specific differences alter the period and amplitude of oscillations. Both E. coli and P. aeruginosa possess the necessary genetic components for oscillatory behavior (NOD and O2-consuming respiratory cytochromes (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a)), but they differ in the number of these components (E. coli harbors three cytochromes, whereas P. aeruginosa has five (Keseler et al., 2013; Arai, 2011; Kanchisa et al., 2016)), as well as in the amino acid sequence and catalytic activity of their respective NODs (Frey and Kallio, 2003). The minimal model used for the oscillatory analysis is presented in Model S2.

To begin, we investigated how environmental variables affected oscillation dynamics, and focused specifically on the rate of NONOate dissociation and dissolved [O\textsubscript{2}] that was in equilibrium with the surrounding atmosphere. The NONOate dissociation rate dictated the delivery of NO to cultures, and it is a function of pH, which was different between media used for E. coli and P. aeruginosa (pH=7.4 for E. coli/MOPS media, pH=7.0 for P. aeruginosa/BSM media). Interestingly, when this parameter was varied over a 4-fold range from its original value, a non-monotonic response was observed, with period and amplitude initially increasing as NO was delivered faster, only to decrease at a higher release rate (Fig. 6A). The [O\textsubscript{2}] in equilibrium with the surrounding atmosphere affects O2 transport into the culture and the maximum [O\textsubscript{2}] that can be attained, and previous observations have shown that this variable has the capacity to eliminate or enable oscillations (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a). When the equilibrium [O\textsubscript{2}] was varied within a 4-fold range, higher values produced oscillations with a shorter period and amplitude than those at lower values (Fig. 6B). Taken together, these simulation results suggest that the NONOate dissociation rate and equilibrium [O\textsubscript{2}] exert considerable influence on the NO oscillation period and amplitude.

To explore variables that can vary between species or strains, we investigated parameters governing the activity of the respiratory cytochromes and NOD (Fig. 6B). For the cytochromes, we observed that increasing the affinity for O2 (e.g., decreasing associated $K_a$) increased the oscillation period and amplitude, whereas increasing the affinity for NO had the opposite effect. This can be rationalized by considering that O2 and NO compete with one another for binding to the cytochromes, and the cytochromes outcompete NOD for O2. With respect to NOD, increasing its affinity for NO increased the amplitude and period, whereas increasing its affinity for O2 had the opposite effect. For O2, increasing its affinity enables NOD to compete more effectively with the cytochromes for this common substrate, which one would expect to decrease the oscillation amplitude and period. The NOD affinity for NO in this context refers to the binding of NO with the O2-bound form of NOD, leading to NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{−} product formation, rather than the binding of NO to NOD prior to O2, which is a process known in E. coli to inhibit NOD activity (Gardner et al., 2000). The increase in oscillation period and amplitude observed upon increasing NO affinity of NOD can be explained by the faster rate at which O2-bound NOD is consumed, leaving more unbound NOD exposed for potential inhibition by NO. This parameter is therefore indirectly increasing the rate of NO-mediated NOD inhibition, resulting in larger [NO] peaks from which the bacteria are slower to recover.

Given that NO-mediated inhibition of NOD appeared to have an effect on oscillation dynamics, and because this inhibitory reaction has not yet been reported for the NOD of P. aeruginosa, Fhp, we explored a parameter directly governing this process ($k_{on,NO}$, the rate of inhibitory binding of NO to NOD). The NO binding rate was increased by two-fold and decreased to zero, to represent the possible absence of this process in P. aeruginosa (Fig. 6C). Interestingly, the oscillations were eliminated when the rate of NO binding was set to zero, suggesting that this inhibitory effect may play an important role in the oscillation mechanism. Since P. aeruginosa cultures were shown experimentally to exhibit oscillations, we hypothesize that, similar to E. coli Hmp, P. aeruginosa Fhp also experiences NO-mediated substrate inhibition; however, this effect requires experimental verification with biochemical assays.

Another important distinction between the previously observed oscillations and those reported here was the required deletion of NOR under the conditions investigated in this study. We therefore examined the effect of varying flux through a NOR reaction on the oscillation
dynamics. Since NOR was absent from the minimal oscillation model, it was introduced by transferring all NOR-related reactions, parameters, and species from the full E. coli model (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a) to the minimal oscillating model. Flux through NOR was varied by changing the rate of NOR expression ($k_{\text{translate,NOR}}$) from zero to the original parameter value, and two-fold the original value (Fig. 6C). Increasing rates of NOR expression resulted in decreased oscillation amplitude and period, which is expected given that this enzyme serves as an additional NO sink. To provide additional experimental confirmation that NOR repress NO oscillations, we performed experiments with E. coli lacking NOR ($\Delta$norV) under the same conditions as used in our previous study (50 µM DPTA NONOate, 10 µM O$_2$ environment) (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a). As predicted, the resulting oscillations within $\Delta$norV E. coli cultures exhibited an increased period and amplitude relative to WT (approximately 14 min and 0.7 µM, respectively, for the maximum oscillation, a 40%
increase over the 10 min and 0.5 µM of WT) (Fig. S8). The considerable impact many of the parameters analyzed here had on the period and amplitude of oscillations suggests that these features should be expected to vary as a function of bacterial species and culturing conditions.

3. Discussion

*P. aeruginosa* are prevalent, opportunistic pathogens that are increasingly refractory to many antibiotics (Breidenstein et al., 2011; Gellaty and Hancock, 2013; Lyczak et al., 2000). Cystic fibrosis patients commonly develop *P. aeruginosa* infections within their airways, nosocomial infections (e.g., ventilator-associated pneumonia) are often caused by *P. aeruginosa*, and *P. aeruginosa* is a frequent inhabitant of chronic, non-healing wounds (Driscoll et al., 2007; Winstanley et al., 2016; Govan and Deretic, 1996). The propensity for *P. aeruginosa* to form biofilms combined with both its innate and acquired resistance toward antibiotics prompted the Center for Disease Control to label multi-drug resistant *P. aeruginosa* as a “serious threat” to public health (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2013). To address this threat, novel treatment modalities are needed (Gellaty and Hancock, 2013; Rasko and Sperandio, 2010), and one of those being explored focuses on NO (Barraud et al., 2006; Deppisch et al., 2016; Friedman et al., 2011; Miller et al., 2013; Yoon et al., 2006).

Due to the ability of NO to disperse *P. aeruginosa* biofilms and the importance of NO detoxification machinery to *P. aeruginosa* virulence (Kakishima et al., 2007; Arai and Iiyama, 2013), several groups have investigated the use of NO as an alternative to conventional antibiotics (Deppisch et al., 2016; Friedman et al., 2011; Miller et al., 2013; Yoon et al., 2006). Miller and colleagues observed a significant reduction in *P. aeruginosa* bacterial load in a rat model of cystic fibrosis with the use of inhaled, gaseous NO when compared to untreated controls (Miller et al., 2013). In a phase I clinical trial, gaseous NO reduced bacterial loads, which included *P. aeruginosa*, within the sputum of cystic fibrosis patients (Deppisch et al., 2016). In addition, Friedman and colleagues observed impressive growth inhibition of numerous Gram-positive and Gram-negative clinical isolates, which included *P. aeruginosa*, when NO-delivering nanoparticles were used in comparison to control particles (Friedman et al., 2011).

Bacterial NO stress networks are dominated by enzymes that rapidly consume NO, and thereby restrict its reactions with other pathways, such as those that lead to protein and DNA damage or metabolic dysfunction. In essence, this is analogous to substrates (e.g., NO) failing to be converted into a desirable product (e.g., inactive, nitrosylated Fe-S clusters) due to competing reactions (e.g., detoxification by NO dioxygenase). To modulate such native pathways for the improvement of cellular properties, as is a typical endeavor in metabolic engineering, understanding how systems quantitatively function is enabling. In the case of NO and *P. aeruginosa*, previous studies have clearly linked this metabolite and its biochemical network to the pathogen’s virulence (Kakishima et al., 2007; Barraud et al., 2006, 2009), and in the context of health and disease, a desirable cellular property would be limited NO flux through detoxification pathways, and increased flux through pathways that damage the pathogen. To enable such interventions, quantitative knowledge of *P. aeruginosa* NO metabolism is desirable much in the same way that quantitative knowledge of substrate metabolism is desirable for rational improvements to the production of chemicals.

Given the critical role of NO in the pathogenicity and biofilm lifestyle of *P. aeruginosa*, as well as its potential to treat *P. aeruginosa* infections (Deppisch et al., 2016; Friedman et al., 2011; Miller et al., 2013; Yoon et al., 2006), we constructed a kinetic model of the *P. aeruginosa* NO biochemical network. The model is a computational tool that enables NO distributions in *P. aeruginosa* cultures to be quantitatively analyzed (Fig. 3), and previous models of this type have been constructed for *E. coli* K-12 and enterohemorrhagic *E. coli* O157:H7 (Robinson and Brynilden, 2013, 2016b). The utility of these models has been demonstrated by uncovering a novel kinetic regime in which NO detoxification machinery performs poorly (Robinson and Brynilden, 2013), predicting dosing regimens that maximize bacteriostasis at prescribed NO payloads (Robinson et al., 2014b), identifying the mechanism through which loss of ClpP impairs *E. coli* NO defenses (Robinson and Brynilden, 2015), and delineating the subnetwork responsible for NO and O2 oscillations within microaerobic environments (Robinson and Brynilden, 2016a). We anticipate that similar advances will be enabled by the *P. aeruginosa* NO model described here, and importantly, translation of the modeling approach we employed, which thus far has only been demonstrated in *E. coli* strains (Robinson and Brynilden, 2016b), to a non-model organism is an important milestone for broader application of the methodology.

Using the model developed in this study, we sought to determine whether NO was cycled in *P. aeruginosa* cultures. We were intrigued by the possibility that NO would be temporarily deactivated only to arise again at a later time, and there is evidence that NO, NO3−, and NO2−, which comprise the metabolites of this potential cycle, are present in the lungs of cystic fibrosis patients (Hassett et al., 2002; Kolpen et al., 2014). Further, this NO cycle appears to be broadly distributed, where 217 species within the KEGG database possess the enzymatic capacity to execute such a cycle (NO dioxygenase, NO3− reductase, and NO-generating NO2− reductase) (Table S7) (Kanehisa et al., 2016). Recently, data supporting the existence of NO cycles in *Corynebacterium glutamicum* (Platen et al., 2014) and *Streptomyces coelicolor* (Sasaki et al., 2016) have been obtained. In addition, NO cycling has been known to occur in plants (Igamberdiev et al., 2010) and mammals (Reutov and Sorokin, 1998), of which the latter includes the function of NO synthases. Computational analysis of NO detoxification by aerobic *P. aeruginosa* cultures (Fig. 3), which were used to ensure Fhp activity, indicated a metabolic block in the cycle at NO3−. That block was relieved as *P. aeruginosa* consumed O2 to drive metabolism into a microaerobic regime, within which NO3− was converted into NO2− and NO2− was consumed without production of any appreciable NO or NO3− (Fig. 4A). Using a genetic approach, we identified NorCB as the enzyme drawing flux out of the NO cycle, and in its deletion strain, ΔnorC, high frequency oscillations in [NO] and [O2] were observed. These oscillations, which resemble those that we previously observed for NO-stressed *P. aeruginosa* in low O2 environments (Robinson and Brynilden, 2016a), are indicative of an unbalanced competition for O2 between Fhp and the aerobic terminal oxidases.

NO is a metabolite with many functions, which range from neuronal signaling and vasodilation to use as an antimicrobial by immune cells (Bogdan, 2001; Nathan, 1992; Pacher et al., 2007). NO also has an important role in the nitrogen cycle as an intermediate in denitrification (Zumft, 1997). At the intersection of pathogenesis and denitrification lies *P. aeruginosa*, which is a dangerous human pathogen that can perform denitrification. *P. aeruginosa* can generate NO, is attacked by NO, and uses NO as a signal for virulence factor expression and biofilm dispersal (Barraud et al., 2009; Van Alst et al., 2007; Silvestrini et al., 1990). Collectively, the work presented here provides a computational tool for the quantitative analysis of NO metabolism in *P. aeruginosa*, and experimental evidence establishing that *P. aeruginosa* prevents NO cycling with the use of NO reductase. In this study, planktonic cultures of *P. aeruginosa* were used, and there is certainly precedent for knowledge gained from planktonic investigations to be important within the biofilm lifestyle (for example, see (Amato and Brynilden, 2014; Amato et al., 2013)). However, biofilms are far more complex, for example with the presence of nutrient gradients and significant growth heterogeneity, as compared to their planktonic counterparts, and it will be exciting to see how *P. aeruginosa* NO metabolism within these lifestyles quantitatively compares as the approaches used here are adapted and applied to biofilms in future research. We postulate that as more quantitative knowledge of *P. aeruginosa* NO metabolism is
gained, such understanding in time, could be translated into the development of novel anti-infectives for treatment of infections caused by this prevalent pathogen.

4. Materials and methods

4.1. Bacterial strains and knockout construction

4.1.1. Bacterial strains

*P. aeruginosa* PAO1 (ATCC 15692) was used in this study, and is referred to as the WT strain. Single gene deletion mutants were constructed from the WT PAO1 parent strain to inactivate NO dioxygenase (ΔflhB), NO reductase (ΔnorC), assimilatory NO$_2$ reductase (ΔnirB), dissimilatory NO$_2$ reductase (ΔnirS), periplasmic NO$_3^-$ reductase (ΔnapA), or membrane-bound NO$_3^-$ reductase (ΔnarG). The strain of *E. coli* used in this study was a ΔnorV mutant (lacking NO reductase) of MG1655, constructed in a previous study (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2013).

4.1.2. Construction of knockout mutants

*P. aeruginosa* mutants were constructed using the lambda Red recombination system (Lesic and Rahme, 2008) to replace the target gene with a gentamicin resistance cassette (harboring gentamicin 3′-acetyltransferase; aacC1). Briefly, the gmR cassette was cloned from the pAS03 plasmid (Shen et al., 2012) using Phusion High-Fidelity DNA Polymerase (New England Biolabs; NEB), with primers possessing flanking ~40 nt sequences that were homologous to the PAO1 genomic sequence upstream and downstream of the target gene to be deleted (see Table S8A for knockout primers used throughout the text). For experiments involving *E. coli*, the minimal media used was MOPS [3-(N-morpholino)propanesulfonic acid] media (Teknova) with 10 mM glucose as the sole carbon source. DPTA NONOate, (Z)-1-[N-(3-amino-propyl)-N-(3-ammoniopropyl)amino] diazen-1-ium-1,2-diolate (Cayman Chemical), was used as a chemical NO donor, which dissociates with a half-life of approximately 1 h at pH 7.0 and 37 °C to release 2 mol of NO per mol of parent compound. Antibiotics used were gentamicin (30 μg/mL) and carbenicillin (100 μg/mL). Unless noted otherwise, all chemical and media components were purchased from Sigma Aldrich or Fisher Scientific, and were autoclaved (LB media) or filter-sterilized (0.2 μm filters) prior to use.

4.2. Growth media and chemicals

Rich media used in this study was LB Broth (BD Difco). The minimal media used for *P. aeruginosa* was basal salts media (BSM) (30.8 mM K$_2$HPO$_4$, 19.3 mM KH$_2$PO$_4$, 15.0 mM (NH$_4$)$_2$SO$_4$, 1 mM MgCl$_2$, and 2 mM FeSO$_4$ (Wolf et al., 1991) supplemented with 15 mM succinate as the sole carbon source (referred to as “BSM” throughout the text). For experiments involving *E. coli*, the minimal media used was MOPS [+N-(morpholinophosphonic acid) media] with 10 mM glucose as the sole carbon source. DPTA NONOate, (Z)-[N-(3-amino-propyl)-N-(3-ammoniopropyl)amino] diazen-1-ium-1,2-diolate (Cayman Chemical), was used as a chemical NO donor, which dissociates with a half-life of approximately 1 h at pH 7.0 and 37 °C to release 2 mol of NO per mol of parent compound. Antibiotics used were gentamicin (30 μg/mL) and carbenicillin (100 μg/mL). Unless noted otherwise, all chemical and media components were purchased from Sigma Aldrich or Fisher Scientific, and were autoclaved (LB media) or filter-sterilized (0.2 μm filters) prior to use.

4.3. DPTA and NO$_3^-$ treatment assays

One mL of LB was inoculated with a scrape of frozen ~80 °C PAO1 cells, and grown overnight (16 h) at 37 °C and 250 rpm. After overnight growth, the culture was mixed gently with a pipette to disrupt cell clumps, and 200 μL was removed to inoculate 20 mL of fresh BSM in a 250 mL baffled shake flask. The flask culture was incubated at 37 °C and 250 rpm until it reached an OD$_{600}$ of 0.2, at which point 8 mL were removed and transferred to 1.5 mL microcentrifuge tubes. The cells were centrifuged at 17,000×g for 1 min, the supernatant was removed, and the pellets were resuspended and combined in 1 mL of fresh, pre-warmed (37 °C) BSM. The cell resuspension was used to inoculate 10 mL of fresh, pre-warmed BSM in a bioreactor to an OD$_{600}$ of 0.05, after removing an equivalent volume (to maintain 10 mL total). Immediately after inoculation, bioreactor cultures were treated with 50 μM DPTA NONOate or 100 μM NaNO$_3$.

DPTA treatment of ΔnorV *E. coli* was performed identically as described previously (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a). Briefly, 1 mL of LB media was inoculated with a scrape from a ~80 °C frozen stock, and grown at 37 °C and 250 rpm for 4 h. 10 μL of LB culture was transferred to fresh MOPS media, and grown at 37 °C and 250 rpm in a hypoxic chamber (Coy Laboratory Products) overnight (16 h). The chamber environment was maintained at an O$_2$ level to achieve a dissolved [O$_2$] in media at equilibrium with the environment of 10 μM, and contained approximately 0.2% (2000 ppm) CO$_2$, and the balance N$_2$. A 250 mL baffled shake-flask with 20 mL of fresh MOPS media was inoculated to an OD$_{600}$ of 0.01 with the overnight culture, and grown at 37 °C and 250 rpm in the chamber. Upon reaching and OD$_{600}$ of 0.2, the flask culture was used to inoculate 10 mL fresh MOPS media in the
bioreactor (operated in the hypoxic chamber) to an OD_{600} of 0.05, and the bioreactor culture was treated immediately with 50 μM DPTA NONOate.

4.4. Bioreactor apparatus

The bioreactor apparatus used to facilitate continuous measurements of [NO] and [O_2] was adopted from a setup in a previous study (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a), and consisted of a 50 mL polypropylene conical tube containing 10 mL of media, open to the ambient air, and magnetically stirred with an ethanol-sterilized (soaked in 70%/30% ethanol/D.I. H_2O for > 1 h) stir bar. The conical tube was suspended in a magnetically-stirred water bath, maintained at 37 °C with a stirring hotplate. The apparatus in its entirety was operated within a biological safety cabinet (Class II, Type A2 Biological Safety Cabinet, Labconco), except for the experiments conducted with *E. coli*, for which the bioreactor apparatus was operated in a hypoxic chamber (described in the section above).

4.5. Quantification of NO and O_2 concentrations

[NO] and [O_2] in bioreactor cultures were monitored continuously (∼1 reads/s) throughout assays, using a 2 mm ISO-NOP sensor (World Precision Instruments) and a fiber-optic FireStingO2 robust miniprobe (PyroScience), respectively.

4.6. Quantification of NO_3^- and NO_2^- concentrations

[NO_3^-] and [NO_2^-] were measured using the Nitrate/Nitrite Colorimetric Assay Kit (Cayman Chemical), which is based on a Griess assay. Samples of 300 μL were removed from the culture, immediately sterile-filtered (0.22 μm Millipore syringe-driven filter, Millipore) into sterile, 1.5 mL microcentrifuge tubes, and stored on wet ice until the end of the assay (when all samples had been collected), at which point samples were moved to a refrigerator (4 °C). The presence of unreacted DPTA in the culture filtrate prevented immediate quantification of [NO_3^-] and [NO_2^-], because Griess assays involve a pH reduction (Tsikas, 2007), which causes instantaneous release of NO from unreacted DPTA, which would rapidly autoxidize to form NO_2^- and NO_3^-, or escape to the gas phase. To accurately account for contributions of unreacted DPTA to NO_2^- and NO_3^- measurements, two steps were taken: (1) samples were stored for at least 24 h before processing, which provided sufficient time for the remaining DPTA to release NO, and for that NO to form NO_2^- and NO_3^-; and (2) a standard curve was generated by adding different concentrations of DPTA (0, 2, 5, 10, 15, 20, 30, and 50 μM) to separate aliquots of growth media (BSM at 37 °C at the beginning of DPTA treatment assays). These standard curve samples were stored under identical conditions (4 °C) for a similar duration as the samples obtained from the DPTA treatment assay, and all samples were assayed for NO_2^- and NO_3^- concentrations simultaneously. The DPTA standards yielded a linear calibration curve, relating [DPTA] to [NO_3^-] and [NO_2^-] (Fig. S9). Based on the DPTA dissociation rate, which was determined from the [NO] curve measured in cell-free media (see Section 4.8.3), the amount of DPTA remaining in the culture at each time point was calculated, and the corresponding concentration of NO_2^- and NO_3^- as determined from the standard curves, was subtracted from the measured values.

4.7. Model construction

Using an existing *E. coli* K-12 MG1655 model as a template (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a), the *P. aeruginosa* PA01 kinetic model was constructed following a procedure that was recently employed to generate a quantitative model of NO stress in enterohemorrhagic *E. coli* O157:H7 (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016b). Briefly, all reactions and parameters classified as organism-independent (e.g., glutathione nitration, NO_2^- hydrolysis) remained unchanged, whereas organism-specific components such as enzymes, metabolites, and transcriptional regulatory interactions were added, removed, or changed in accordance with the available body of literature on *P. aeruginosa* physiology (Arai et al., 2005, 2014; Schreiber et al., 2007; Arai, 2011; Zumft, 1997; Silvestrini et al., 1994, 1990; Carlson et al., 1982; Cutruzzola et al., 1997, 2001; Frey et al., 2002; Fukumori et al., 1985; SooHoo and Hollocher, 1991; Shapleigh et al., 1987; Wakamaki et al., 2010). We note a difference in the pH of the growth media used for *P. aeruginosa* compared to that of *E. coli* (7.0 for *P. aeruginosa* grown in BSM media, 7.4 for *E. coli* grown in MOPS minimal media). Given that the magnitude of this pH difference was small, we assumed that it would only influence the system through its impact on the DPTA NONOate dissociation rate, which was a parameter that was optimized using data from cell-free experiments (Fig. S2).

A BLAST analysis was conducted for each of the enzymes in the original *E. coli* model to assess the amino acid sequence similarities with the corresponding *P. aeruginosa* homologues, if one existed (Table S9). Although *P. aeruginosa* possessed homologues for most (16 out of 20) of the enzymes, the amino acid sequences were not highly conserved, with a maximum similarity of ~80% for the iron-sulfur cluster assembly protein IscU. Given the relatively low sequence similarity among homologous proteins, their associated rate constants were released to be optimized during the initial model training process. The absolute concentrations of metabolites, biomolecules, and enzymes were unavailable for *P. aeruginosa*, and were therefore also released for optimization. Model parameters and species concentrations that were released for optimization were allowed to vary with bounds that were approximated based on literature data available for those components or functions in different bacterial species and/or different experimental conditions (Tables S4–S6).

In addition to releasing parameter values, the model adaptation process also required changes to the network structure (i.e., addition/removal of reactions or changes to their stoichiometry). The *P. aeruginosa* O_2-respiration machinery differs greatly from that of *E. coli* (see Section 2.1.1 and refs (Keseler et al., 2013; Arai, 2011; Kanehisa et al., 2016)). Therefore, the *E. coli* cytochrome ubiquinol oxidases were removed and replaced with the five *P. aeruginosa* oxidases (Cyo, CIO, Cbb3-1, Cbb3-2, and Aa3), where ubiquinol served as the electron donor for Cyo and CIO, whereas Cbb3-1, Cbb3-2, and Aa3 received electrons from cytochrome c.

The other network region requiring substantial changes to architecture involved the denitification reactions and transcriptional regulation of the involved enzymes. Whereas NO_2^- and NO_3^- reductases were omitted from the *E. coli* model, the *P. aeruginosa* NO_2^- reductases (NH_2-forming NirBD and NO-forming NirS) and NO_3^- reductases (NarGH and NapAB, both NO_2^- -forming) were incorporated into the present model. Transcriptional regulation of the main NO detoxification enzymes in *P. aeruginosa* (NOD: Fhp and NOR: NorCB) is similar to that of *E. coli* (see Section 2.1.1 and refs (Keseler et al., 2013; Arai, 2011)). Therefore, the *E. coli* cytochrome ubiquinol oxidases were removed and replaced with the five *P. aeruginosa* oxidases (Cyo, CIO, Cbb3-1, Cbb3-2, and Aa3), where ubiquinol served as the electron donor for Cyo and CIO, whereas Cbb3-1, Cbb3-2, and Aa3 received electrons from cytochrome c.

The other network region requiring substantial changes to architecture involved the denitification reactions and transcriptional regulation of the involved enzymes. Whereas NO_2^- and NO_3^- reductases were omitted from the *E. coli* model, the *P. aeruginosa* NO_2^- reductases (NH_2-forming NirBD and NO-forming NirS) and NO_3^- reductases (NarGH and NapAB, both NO_2^- -forming) were incorporated into the present model. Transcriptional regulation of the main NO detoxification enzymes in *P. aeruginosa* (NOD: Fhp and NOR: NorCB) is similar to that of *E. coli*, in that NOD and NOR are strongly upregulated in the presence of NO. However, while Fhp appears to be regulated independently via the NO-responsive FhpR regulator (Arai et al., 2005), NorCB regulation is coupled with that of the NO_2^- and NO_3^- reductases (Schreiber et al., 2007; Arai, 2011). The expression of NorCB, NAR, and NIT are all regulated (directly or indirectly) by the anaerobic response regulator (NarXL), which in turn controls expression of the denitification response regulator (DNR) and a two-component nitrate sensing regulator (NarXL). These three transcription factors (ANR, DNR, and NarXL) are involved (to varying extents) in the regulation of NAR, NIT, and NarXL transcriptional regulators were included in the model (see Tables S2 and S3 for reactions and kinetic expressions involving the regulators).
4.8. Parameter optimization

4.8.1. Error minimization

Model parameters were optimized following a procedure described previously (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a; Adolfsen and Brynildsen, 2015). Briefly, model simulations were run by numerically integrating the governing system of ordinary differential equations using the Matlab ode15s stiff ODE solver. The Matlab lsqcurvefit function was used to minimize the sum of the squared residuals (SSR) between model simulation data \((y_{\text{sim}})\) and experimental measurements \((y_{\text{meas}})\), normalized by the experimental variance \((\sigma^2)\):

\[
SSR' = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{(y_{\text{meas},i} - y_{\text{sim},i})^2}{\sigma_{\text{meas}}^2}
\]

where \(SSR'\) represents the variance-normalized SSR. To improve coverage of the solution space, the minimization was repeated for 1000 iterations, where each iteration began with a different set of randomized initial guess values for the varied parameters, from within their allowed bounds.

4.8.2. Estimation of parametric uncertainty

To estimate confidence in the optimized parameter values after the initial SSR’ minimization process, and in some cases identify improved optimal solutions, a subsequent Markov chain Monte Carlo (MCMC) procedure was employed (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a) using the MCEmp function from the HYPERSPACE software package (Zamora-Sillerio et al., 2011). The SSR’ was used as the cost function, and the algorithm was limited to 10,000 parameter evaluations (individual model simulations). Relative quality of fit for each of the parameter sets was quantified by the evidence ratio (ER), which is derived from the Akaike Information Criterion (AIC) (Hurvich and Tsai, 1989; Turkheimer et al., 2003):

\[
AIC_{i,j} = n \ln \left( \frac{SSR'_i}{n} \right) + 2k + \frac{2k(k+1)}{n-k-1}
\]

\[
\Delta_i = AIC_{i,j} - \min(AIC_j)
\]

\[
w_i = \exp \left( -\frac{\Delta_i}{2} \right) / \sum_{i=1}^{n} \exp \left( -\frac{\Delta_i}{2} \right)
\]

\[
ER_i = \frac{w_{\text{best}}}{w_i}
\]

where \(n\) is the number of data points, \(k\) is the number of fit parameters (plus one, due to the estimation of the SSR (Turkheimer et al., 2003)), \(w_i\) is the Akaike weight of parameter set \(i\), \(w_{\text{best}}\) is the weight of the best-fit (minimum AIC) parameter set, and \(P\) is the total number of parameter sets being compared. Parameter sets with an ER \(\geq 10\) (less than 10% as likely as the best-fit set) were discarded from further analyses (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2016a; Adolfsen and Brynildsen, 2015).

4.8.3. Model training and ensemble generation

Model parameters were optimized in three different groups or modules: (1) extracellular, (2) respiration, and (3) remaining intracellular and NO detoxification/repair. The extracellular module was optimized first, and included three parameters: \(k_{\text{NONOate,DPTA}}, \ k_{\text{NO-2},2}, \) and \(k_{\text{NO-2}O_2}\) which governed the dissociation rate of DPTA, the rate of NO autocatalysis, and the rate of NO exchange with the gas phase, respectively. The volumetric mass transfer coefficient governing O\(_2\) exchange with the gas phase, \(k_{\text{O2,O2}}\), was determined independently by measuring dissolved O\(_2\) in cell-free growth media following N\(_2\)-purging, as described previously (Robinson and Brynildsen, 2013). The three extracellular parameters were trained on half-hourly measurements of [NO], [NO\(_2\)], and [NO\(_3\)] in cell-free BSM bioreactors treated with 50 \(\mu\)M DPTA, over the course of 2 h (Table S4). After the initial SSR’ minimization, the best-fit parameter sets (with ER < 10) were used as initial points in a subsequent MCMC analysis, yielding an ensemble of viable models (all ER < 10) differing only in the values of the three extracellular parameters. The confidence interval (CI) of each parameter was calculated as the range (min–max) of that parameter value among the ensemble members.

The respiratory module was optimized second, and included parameters governing concentrations and catalytic activities (e.g., \(k_{\text{O2,in}}, \ K_{\text{O2,}2,2}\) of the NADH dehydrogenases, respiratory cytochromes, and their associated substrates and products, where a total of 27 parameters were optimized. The parameters were trained on dissolved \([O_2]\) measurements of bioreactor cultures immediately after inoculation of WT PAO1 cells to an OD\(_{600}\) of 0.05 (in the absence of DPTA treatment) (Table S5). The concentration of O\(_2\) was measured continuously, but only for 10 min post-inoculation, to avoid growth-related effects not captured by the model. Since the three extracellular parameters optimized previously (\(k_{\text{NONOate,DPTA}}, \ k_{\text{NO-2},2}\) and \(k_{\text{NO-2}O_2}\)) have no effect on the system in the absence of NO, they were fixed to their best-fit values during the optimization of the respiratory parameters. A subsequent MCMC analysis was performed with the 27 respiration parameters to generate an ensemble of models, and quantify the corresponding parameter CIs.

After training of the extracellular and respiratory parameters, the remaining intracellular parameters—the majority of which included those related to NO stress, detoxification, and repair—were optimized. A total of 137 parameters were released to be optimized on experimental measurements of \([NO], \ [O_2], \ [NO_2], \) and \([NO_3]\) in WT PAO1 cultures treated with 50 \(\mu\)M DPTA for 30 min (Table S6). [NO] and \([O_2]\) were measured continuously, whereas [NO\(_2\)] and [NO\(_3\)] were measured immediately after DPTA treatment, and at 30 min post-treatment. In addition to randomly initializing the 137 parameters at the start of each optimization iteration, the previously trained extracellular and respiratory parameters were set to values randomly selected from their respective ensembles. In this way, the uncertainties of the extracellular and respiratory parameter values were incorporated into the optimization process, rather than fixing them to single values.

Furthermore, in the subsequent MCMC analysis of the 137 intracellular parameters, the extracellular and respiratory parameters were also permitted to vary (within their CIs), to enable a more complete exploration of the viable parameter space (Table S6).

Acknowledgements

We thank Professors Zemer Gitai and Albert Siryaporn for technical assistance with \(P. \ aeruginosa\), and Anna Ren and Ismael Catovic for their initial work on the model. This work was supported by the National Science Foundation (CBET-1453325), and Princeton University (Forese Family Fund for Innovation, Lidow Senior Thesis Fund, start-up funds).

Appendix A. Supporting information

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found in the online version at doi:10.1016/j.ymben.2017.03.006.

References
